



TRANSFER AND ARTICULATION OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE Meeting Notes

December 15, 2011

10:00 AM - 12:30 PM

Dixon University Center

Harrisburg, PA 17110-1201

Remote Locations: CC of Beaver County, IUP, Clarion, Bucks CCC

Conference Line: 717-705-0091

1. Roll Call

2. ACTION ITEM: Suggested wording clarification to Agenda Item #4a of the [November 17, 2011 Meeting Notes](#): "Recommendation from Steering Committee to base student verification for statewide program articulation on students' "effective graduation date" rather than the institution's "effective implementation date".

- *Students graduating with an associate of arts or associate of science degree from a participating institution ~~regardless of the program~~, are eligible to transfer under statewide program-to-program articulation starting with the effective graduation date.*
- *Two-year institutions (and four-year institutions that offer parallel bachelor degrees) would indicate the "effective graduation date" at the same time they identify the articulated degree program. Two-year institutions with articulated associate degrees will indicate the "effective graduation date" and four-year institutions offering parallel bachelor degrees will indicate the "effective matriculation date" in the Statewide Program Articulation Database.*
- *Institutions would provide the following data elements in the Statewide Articulation Database on PA TRAC:*
 - *Associate-Degree Institutions*
 - *Institution Name*
 - *Name of Articulated Associate Degree(s) (i.e., Administration of Justice)*
 - *Award Type (i.e., AA, AS)*
 - *Effective Graduation Date*
 - *Bachelor-Degree Institutions*
 - *Institution Name*
 - *Name of Parallel Bachelor Degree(s) (i.e., Criminal Justice)*
 - *Award Type (i.e., BA, BS, etc.)*
 - *Effective Matriculation Date*
- *Students, advisors, faculty and the public would then access the information by use a searchable dashboard on PA TRAC.*

TAOC approved the revised wording by a vote of 29-0.

3. Updates & Announcements

- a. Fall 2011 End of Term Transfer Reports due in March 2012. PDE will provide additional information at a later date.
- b. Statewide Program-to-Program Articulation Database
 - i. Each TAOC institution should appoint two Points of Contact for the database. An institution's primary and secondary TAOC reps will be assigned this responsibility, unless the institution notifies PDE otherwise.
 - ii. Statewide Articulation Database Training Webinar

1. All database contacts must complete the training webinar to access to the Statewide Program-to-Program Articulation Database and enter their institution's degree program information in the system.
 2. PDE emailed all contacts on Dec. 12 with December Webinar information:
 - a. Webinar dates – December 20 at 11 AM & December 21 at 3 PM
 - b. Register online by 5 PM on December 19.
 3. January webinar dates TBD
- c. Dates to Remember:
- i. December 20 @ 11 AM & December 21 @ 3 PM – Statewide Articulation Database Training Webinars
 - ii. January 1 – TAOC Standards Subcommittees reconvene
 - iii. January 30 – Deadline to submit new courses for review by the Framework Standards Subcommittees.
 - iv. March 31 – Deadline for Framework Standards Subcommittees to review and vote on new Framework courses
 - v. May 15 – Deadline for TAOC institutions to establish transfer course equivalencies for newly approved Framework courses

4. Review Articulation Agreement Voting Process

- Primary voting members of TAOC will be provided with links to the final draft agreements and to an electronic voting form on PA TRAC.
- 2/3 majority vote required to approve.
 - Approved agreements will be posted to PA TRAC within a week of being approved. PDE will notify TAOC members when agreements are approved and posted.
 - Rejected agreements will be returned to the PAC along with TAOC feedback and guidance for revising the agreement.
- One vote per voting TAOC member. All voting TAOC members are expected to vote regardless of the program (i.e. if institution does not have a specific program for articulation, should vote anyhow.) Votes must be submitted by deadline to be included in tally.
- Tips for reviewing final draft agreements
 - Does the agreement identify foundation-level content and competencies required for entry at junior level?
 - Does the agreement align with policies of TAOC Statewide Program Articulation?
 - Does the agreement include requirements that are consistent with those of native students in the parallel bachelor program?
 - Ensure agreement addresses competencies/coursework/content area and does not identify required courses
 - How are grading requirements included?
 - Is the agreement logical?

Discussion:

- How do we ensure the agreements are seamless and meaningful for the student? The challenges are in looking at the competencies/coursework/content area so that the student is not duplicating or repeating.
- Some institutions are using curriculum maps to align current curricula with the agreement requirements (content and competencies), identify gaps and make modifications. Sharing this information could help other institutions implement the agreements on their respective campuses.
- Institutions struggle with how to implement the agreements operationally and in a way that makes sense academically.
- Could we develop a process where we all identify alignment? This could be a task assigned to an ad hoc committee or subcommittee of TAOC. Or could go back to pilot agreements and see what was done there.

- TAOC members would benefit greatly by talking to other TAOC members and encouraging faculty to talk to their peers at other institutions.

5. DISCUSSION ITEM: Review Draft Program Articulation Agreements

- a. Art – Yun Kim, East Stroudsburg
 - The agreement recommends students prepare an art portfolio as part of the associate degree. The portfolio is not a requirement since not all institutions require it at the foundation level.
 - The PAC recommends including the Associate of Fine Arts (AFA) as a transferable associate degree. TAOC accepted the recommendation by a vote of 29-0.
- b. Communications – Ginny Carter, Delaware CCC
The Communication PAC is recommending one general agreement that can work with the various communication areas.
- c. Criminal Justice – Ted Nichols, Penn Highlands
The CJ PAC's agreement is based on 7 foundational content areas and related competencies.
- d. Environmental Science – Inno Onwueme, IUP
The Environmental Science PAC is working on the last revisions. The group is doing well. The recommended agreement includes two tracks which makes it different from other agreements.
- e. Geography – Ron Young, HACC
The Geography PAC is considering the comments from TAOC members and expects to have a final draft to TAOC by the December deadline. The PAC recommends TAOC expand the Framework course offerings to include foundational Geography course(s).
- f. History – Wade Davenport, Reading
The History has received TAOC 's comments and will respond accordingly when it submits it's final draft to TAOC.
- g. Modern Languages – Barbara Lyman, Shippensburg
The PAC used guidance from American Council on Teaching of Foreign Language to develop the agreement. A final draft has been submitted to PDE for TAOC consideration.
- h. Music – Stan Komacek, California
PAC members continue to struggle with implementation concerns, specifically how to the receiving institutions will recognize performance competencies.
- i. Political Science – Karyn Sproles, Carlow
The PAC is on track to submit a final agreement by the deadline. They are making a few adjustments for clarification and in response to TAOC feedback.
- j. Social Work – Darla Coffey, West Chester
The Social Work PAC is still working on the 2nd draft, due to questions/clarifications regarding CSWE accreditation. As soon as 2nd draft is ready, PDE will forward it to TAOC for review and comment. The PAC will then have one week to respond to that feedback and submit a final draft for TAOC vote. TAOC members should expect to receive the 2nd draft close to the beginning of the spring semester.
- k. Sociology – Mary Frances Archey, CCAC
The Sociology PAC is on track to submit a final draft for TAOC vote by the deadline.

- l. Theatre – Jill Murray, Lackawanna
Jill recognized co-chair Michael Whistler for his leadership. The PAC is on track to meet the December deadline.
- m. 4-8 Education – Phil Ginnetti, Edinboro
The agreement is based on the 4-8 Guidelines issued by PDE. Bob Smith (Millersville) expressed reservations about the vague content descriptions and lack of competencies in the 2nd draft. Bill Sands (IUP) agreed to relay TAOC's concerns from the meeting and the 2nd draft feedback process with PAC members. The 4-8 PAC may need additional time to complete a final draft.
- n. Secondary Education – Francie Spigelmyer, Butler
The PAC was unable to schedule a meeting before the end of the semester. Work will continue well into the spring.

6. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation from Steering Committee to form two standing subcommittees in Spring 2012:

- Framework Subcommittee to review the 30-Credit Transfer Framework and related issues.
- Assessment Subcommittee to evaluate and assess transfer system effectiveness.

Discussion:

- Act 114 requires TAOC to develop an assessment/evaluation plan for the transfer system.
- There are several unresolved issues related to the Framework:
 - The Framework is built on courses and standards; the agreements are based on competencies.
 - The Framework has not been reviewed since it was developed.
 - Some PACs recommended adding titles to the Framework offerings.
 - Two subcommittees have proposed new course titles for the Framework.
 - Some subcommittees have taken liberty with their course approvals, while others have limited approval only to courses with near-match titles that meet the category standards.
- TAOC voted 29-0 to form both subcommittees in the spring and to continue discussions concerning composition, charge, timeline, etc. at the next TAOC meeting.

7. DISCUSSION ITEM: Develop various ways to educate all stakeholders on statewide program articulation.

- a. Who needs to be educated?
- b. Mode of delivery?
- c. Topics?

Discussion:

- Suggestion to include information about Transfer Credit Framework on individual course syllabi or about program articulation on advising check sheets.
- Add P2P info to PA TRAC and institutional websites
- Note Framework courses in institution catalogs (i.e., "PA TRAC course", or "Framework Course", etc.)
- Consider webinars or podcast recordings to help explain P2P and the Framework as well as the transfer system as a whole

8. New Business

9. Next meeting: TBD

Pennsylvania Department of Education
 Transfer and Articulation Oversight Committee
 December 15, 2011 TAOC Meeting Notes

Attendees:

TAOC Rep.	TAOC Institution	Location
Ira Blake	Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Barbara Ford	Bucks County Community College	Bucks
Karyn Sproles	Carlow University	Beaver
Brenda Shields	Cheyney University of Pennsylvania	Phone
Ivan Banks	Cheyney University of Pennsylvania	Phone
Ronald Nowaczyk	Clarion University of Pennsylvania	Clarion
Frances Dice	Community College of Allegheny County	Beaver
Mary Frances Archey	Community College of Allegheny County	Beaver
John Gall	Community College of Beaver County	Beaver
Melissa Denardo	Community College of Beaver County	Beaver
Peggy Hennequant	Community College of Beaver County	Beaver
Judith Gay	Community College of Philadelphia	Bucks
Grant Snyder	Delaware County Community College	Bucks
Yun Kim	East Stroudsburg University of Pennsylvania	Phone
Cindy Doherty	Harrisburg Area Community College	DUC
Inno Onwueme	Indiana University of Pennsylvania	IUP
Bill Sands	Indiana University of Pennsylvania	IUP
Emily Wagner	Kutztown University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Tom Leamer	Lehigh Carbon Community College	DUC
Virginia Mihalik	Lehigh Carbon Community College	DUC
Jill Mitchley	Lock Haven University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Dana Clark	Luzerne County Community College	DUC
Libby Yeager	Luzerne County Community College	DUC
Robert Smith	Millersville University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Pete Cabbage	Montgomery County Community College	Bucks
Mark Henry	Northampton Community College	DUC
Laura Frank	PA Commission for Community Colleges	DUC
Thomas Gregory	Pennsylvania College of Technology	DUC
Wil Delpilar	Pennsylvania Department of Education	DUC
Julie Kane	Pennsylvania Department of Education	DUC
Ted Nichols	Pennsylvania Highlands Community College	IUP
Kathleen Howley	PASSHE	DUC
Pete Skoner	Saint Francis University	IUP
Barbara Lyman	Shippensburg University	DUC
William Williams	Slippery Rock University	DUC
Michele O'Connor	Temple University	Phone
Darla Coffey	West Chester University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Robert Wright	Westmoreland County Community College	Beaver