

## TRANSFER AND ARTICULATION OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

## Meeting Notes

Thursday, May 23, 2013 10:00 AM - 12:30 AM Harrisburg, PA

Remote Locations: IUP, CC of Beaver County, Montgomery County CC

1. Roll Call – See attendance chart at end of notes

#### 2. Updates/Announcements

#### a. TAOC Membership

Legislation stipulates TAOC representatives serve staggered 4-year terms. The Secretary of Education appointed the presidents of the participating institutions to serve on TAOC but permits presidents to have someone serve on their behalf. When a TAOC representative's term is about to end, PDE will notify the institution's president. The president may then re-appoint the representative or appoint someone new. Members with terms expiring this year will be notified this summer, so that representatives are in place for the fall semester.

#### b. **Pennsylvania Electronic Student Transcripts and Records System (PA eSTARS)** Institutions have until June 30, 2013, to sign-up for the PA eSTARS initiative and have PDE pay their \$3,000 on-boarding fee. This is a voluntary initiative being underwritten by a federal grant awarded to PDE. Parchment is the selected vendor.

As of May 20<sup>th</sup>, 168 of the 765 eligible Local Education Agencies (LEAs) have signed. Seventy-three of the 154 eligible IHEs use the Parchment platform to send and/or receive electronic transcripts – 12 IHEs have signed under the PA eSTARS initiative. TAOC members should watch for weekly bulletins from Parchment. More information is available at PAeSTARS.com.

There is a possibility that the PA eSTARS initiative may be extended through December 31, 2013. PDE will notify TAOC reps if this happens.

A few TAOC members expressed concern over increasing costs for successive years given Parchment's cost model and cited this is as the main reason they have not signed. PDE will relay these concerns to Parchment as well as forward the IHE rate card to TAOC members.

#### c. 2013-2014 Meeting Schedule

TAOC will meet August 15 from 10AM-12:30PM at Dixon University Center. Remote locations and a phone bridge with a limited number of lines will be available.

TAOC will meet everyone other month beginning in August. A proposed schedule for AY2013-14 will be emailed to members in about two weeks. Members are asked to email PDE as soon as possible with any conflicts, especially those that impact several members (i.e., holidays, conferences, sector meetings, graduation activities, etc.).



## 3. Demo of New Features on PA TRAC Website

Julie demonstrated two new features on PA TRAC.

 Search for Statewide Program-to-Program Agreements – This new tool allows students to search for P2P agreements by Field of Study, Associate Degree Institution and Bachelor Degree Institution. The Search is accessible from the homepage, drop-down menus under the Student tab and Advisor tab, and the Search For tab.

Search for Statewide Program-to-Program Agreements			
Statewide Program-to-Program (P2P) Agreements allow students who graduate with specified associate degrees to transfer as juniors into bachelor degrees in similar fields of study at designated four-year institutions.			
P2P agreements serve as pathways into undergraduate majors at participating four-year institutions and help minimize loss of credits when transferring from one institution to another.			
To search for Statewide P2P Agreements that may apply to you, enter some or all of the information below and click "Search".			
Field of Study:			
Any Field of Study			
(Select your general program of interest)			
Institutions offering the Associate degree:			
Start typing to see results			
(Type the name of a College or University that offers the program)			
Institutions offering the Bachelor degree:			
Start typing to see results			
(Type the name of a College or University that offers the program)			
Search			

Currently, the <u>Search for Statewide Program-to-Program Agreements</u> and the <u>Search for</u> <u>Transfer Agreements</u> are separate tools. The P2P Search pulls information from the Statewide P2P Database; the Transfer Agreement Search pulls information from the Transfer and Articulation Management Center (TAMC) and requires institutions to upload advising guides explaining the agreements to students. AcademyOne is in the process of putting the P2P information in TAMC. A basic P2P "flyer" will be attached to each P2P degree identified by the institutions. See Appendix A.

2. "Will My Credits Transfer?" – The PA TRAC website has been "live" since May 2008; yet, only a few hundred students have saved their course history in a PA TRAC Student Account. A Student Account allows a student 1) to build/save their course history, 2) to create and compare transfer equivalency maps among transfer institutions, and 3) to share transfer information with key contacts at TAOC colleges. Advisors of transfer students are urged to promote the PA TRAC Student Account tool and its benefits.

In an effort to encourage students to create accounts and to have them fully benefit from the resources on PA TRAC, AcademyOne created "Will My Credits Transfer?" (WMCT). A link to WMCT is found on at the top of each college's Transfer Profile page.

By clicking on the WMCT link on a college's Transfer Profile, a student uses a series of "pop-up windows" to enter previous coursework and prior learning exams and see how credit may transfer to that college. At the end, students are shown a "course equivalency map" and given an opportunity to save the map and their coursework to a student account.



pennsylvania

SEER MUSARINGULATION CENTER

A future goal is to have transfer students be able to electronically load their previous coursework into their accounts using AcademyOne's "Coursework Importer". The Coursework Importer is an interface that permits a student's authenticated coursework information to be imported into AcademyOne's system from the college's student information system (SIS). This not only saves the student time by eliminating the need for the student to manually input the coursework information, but the data itself is assured to be accurate, because its source is the institution's SIS. More information will be provided at a much later date.

Through a competitive procurement process, PDE selected AcademyOne to provide the electronic transfer and articulation system and to host the PA TRAC website for at least another two years (AY13-14 and AY14-15).

As part of the new contract, AcademyOne will redesign PA TRAC to improve navigation, to comply with ADA requirements and to be accessible with Android devices. Over the years, PA TRAC has been pieced together based on user feedback and changing legislation and TAOC policy. This work will begin in July 2013 with hopes of being complete by the start of the Fall 2013 semester.

#### 4. Assessment of the Transfer System

Legislation requires TAOC to develop a plan for assessing and evaluating the transfer system – including identifying and collecting data – and submitting an annual report to the General Assembly. In addition, assessment data is critical to future policy-making by TAOC and to ensure current efforts are having the desired outcome – saving students time and money when transferring from one institution to another in pursuit of a postsecondary degree.

The Transfer Assessment will be conducted in three phases between April 2013 and June 2014. PDE has secured a federal grant to support the project during this time. The grant expires June 30, 2014. The three project phases are as follows:

- 1. Develop a written framework for the annual assessment of the transfer system (April-August 2013)
- 2. Implement the annual assessment plan (September 2013-March 2014)
- 3. Analyze data and write an annual report (April-June 2014)



Phase I began April 29. PDE contracted with Barbara Clements of ESP Solutions Group to assist the Assessment Subcommittee with developing a written framework for the annual assessment of the transfer system. Barb spent the last few weeks collecting information about our transfer system and interviewing Subcommittee members and other key stakeholders.

The Subcommittee will convene in Harrisburg on May 31 to work on the first draft of a plan. PDE appointed Tom Gregory, primary TAOC representative from Pennsylvania College of Technology, as subcommittee chair. Keith Brown from the Association of Institutional Research and a member of Pennsylvania's state support team for the statewide longitudinal database also will assist the group. Keith developed the transfer reports for the University of North Carolina system.

Similar to the process used to develop the statewide P2P agreements, TAOC members will be asked to review and comment on the Subcommittee's first draft. PDE will notify TAOC members when the first draft is posted and provide instructions for submitting feedback. The Subcommittee is expected to take TAOC comments into consideration before submitting its final recommendation. The goal is to have TAOC members vote on the final recommendation by the August 15<sup>th</sup> TAOC meeting. Approval of the Annual Assessment Plan requires a 2/3 vote by voting TAOC members.

#### 5. Transfer Credit Framework

The Framework Equivalency Standards Subcommittees annually review courses January-March. Colleges then have until May 15 to establish course equivalencies with newly approved Framework courses. The timeframe needs to be extended this year. See Agenda Item #6.a. below.

Subcommittees will be asked to consider new Framework titles after they review and act upon all of the proposed Framework courses in their queue.

PDE will be appointing a 2-yr and a 4-yr chair to each Framework Subcommittee. Currently, each subcommittee has one chair. The co-chair model was used for the Program Articulation Committees and will provide continuity should one of the chairs leave or be unable to do the work in a timely manner. This model also reinforces the spirit of collaboration among the 2- and 4-yr institutions participating in the transfer system.

## 6. TAOC/PA TRAC Maintenance Activities

### a. Course Catalog Extracts

AcademyOne loaded course catalog extracts for all of the fully-participating institutions as of February 1. As a result:

- Colleges have new courses in CEMC that they may want to propose to the Framework Subcommittees
- The system flagged courses that have changed since the institution submitted its last catalog. Such changes include new course prefix (i.e., college changed communications courses from SPE to COM), new course description (i.e., course now has a prerequisite), course title change (i.e., PSY101 Foundation of Psychology is now called PSY101 General Psychology), etc.
- Courses that no longer appear in an institution's catalog were given an "Effective End Date". (i.e., ENG112 Composition Writing I (09/01/07-01/03/13))

Some colleges no longer have any approved Framework courses, because 1) the approved Framework course no longer exists at the college and now has an "Effective End Date" or 2) the approved Framework course has changed, which means the course must be re-proposed to the appropriate subcommittee. PDE and AcademyOne have been notifying institutions that have these issues and have offered technical assistance accordingly.



The institution – not PDE or AcademyOne – is responsible for reviewing their course extract file for accuracy and completeness. AcademyOne loads the extract file that is provided to them by the institution's designated point of contact.

#### b. Course Equivalency Management Center (CEMC)

To accommodate colleges that want to propose new Framework courses, PDE has asked the subcommittees to continue reviewing proposed courses beyond the annual review period of January-March. <u>NOTE: Proposed courses must include a current syllabus.</u>

All CEMC users have Course Updates that need immediate attention. When a new catalog is uploaded, the system flags courses that changed significantly and are associated with an equivalency. CEMC users receive electronic notification about these changes and must decide whether to "accept" the course pairing that includes the changed course, "deny" it, or "evaluate" it and establish a new course equivalency.

PDE and AcademyOne have been notifying institutions that are out of compliance (i.e., do not have any approved Framework courses, do not meet the minimum requirements for each Framework category, etc.)

TAOC members should contact their institutional CEMC user(s) to make sure the college is compliant with TAOC policy. For technical assistance or questions, contact Karen Todd at AcademyOne or Julie Kane at PDE.

#### c. Statewide P2P Articulation Database

See agenda item #3.a. above.

Colleges had until May 15, 2013, to identify associate degrees and bachelor degrees that meet the requirements of P2P agreements effective Fall 2013:

- Art
- Communications
- Criminal Justice
- Environmental Science
- Geography
- History
- Modern Languages
- Social Work
- Sociology
- Theatre

## d. Transfer Profile

Colleges are expected to review and update their Transfer Profiles on PA TRAC at least once year in July.

Julie presented an overview of the statewide transfer system to the Pennsylvania Advisory Council on Military and Veterans Education (PACMVE) on May 17. PACMVE members suggested the following to TAOC:

- Have all participating institutions identify a Veterans Contact on their respective Transfer Profiles on PA TRAC
- Have colleges identify prior learning exams (i.e., AP, CLEP, DANTES) and acceptable scores in CEMC
- Develop a webpage on PA TRAC that provides transitioning service members with resources that meet their unique needs



A few colleges have Veterans Contacts listed on their Profile pages; a few have entered prior learning exam information in CEMC. While not a requirement of the transfer system, PDE encourages participating institutions to consider these suggestions. AcademyOne is creating a veterans page for PA TRAC. PDE will vet the page with TAOC at a later date.

#### 7. Statewide Program Articulation

- a. Implementation Issues?
  - i. "Buy-in" by institutions
  - ii. How to determine if the associate degree listed on the transcript of a community college graduate transferring to a PASSHE school was aligned with the P2P agreements.
  - iii. Other?

TAOC members and advisors at 2-year institutions have contacted PDE several times this spring to express concern with how P2P is being implemented and communicated at 4-yr institutions. Recent listserv discussions echo these concerns. Issues include:

- Four-year faculty members are unaware or have limited knowledge of statewide P2P (i.e., impact to their programs, expectations of faculty and students, the legality of P2P, etc.)
- Transfer students are being advised that they will need to take additional coursework due to the 4-yr program's rotation of courses.
- Transfer counselors at 4-yr institutions don't know which associate degrees meet P2P requirements or the "rules" of statewide P2P. This is resulting in transfer students receiving misinformation. In one instance, the student was so frustrated that she decided to transfer to a private college that does not participate in the statewide transfer system.

Julie reminded everyone that last year TAOC agreed to the following statement: "During the transition to the effective dates of the various statewide program-to-program agreements, the participating institutions will strive to be student-centered and make the transfer of credits as seamless as possible for students."

Statewide P2P went into effect Fall 2012. At this point, there is no excuse for institution faculty and personnel not knowing about it. TAOC members are expected to communicate with their institutions and to take steps to resolve issues such as those identified above.

When issues occur between participating institutions, those institutions' TAOC members should make every attempt to resolve it directly. If the issue cannot be resolved, then the institution with the complaint should follow the <u>Dispute Resolution process</u>.

Barbara Lyman (Ship) suggested an FAQ to help faculty understand P2P. Mary Frances Archey (CCAC) suggested a communication tool kit. Kathleen Howley (PASSHE) said the PASSHE CAOs are meeting tomorrow and that they would try to have a discussion regarding disseminating the information throughout academic departments at the PASSHE universities as well as discuss best practices.

PDE proposed forming an ad hoc subcommittee to identify communication strategies and best practices that inform faculty and personnel at the participating institutions. Dana Clark (Luzerne) volunteered to lead the group. TAOC requested the subcommittee provide its recommendation by August 1, so that the information can be presented to faculty/personnel before the start of the semester. Julie Kane will email.



Dana asked TAOC members to forward best practices to her or Libby Yeager (Luzerne) as soon as possible. TAOC members who would like to join this group should email Dana or PDE.

#### b. Student Verification

According to a recent discussion from the listserv, receiving colleges would like an obvious way of identifying transferring P2P students. Suggestions include a common name or tag for articulated associate degrees (i.e., AA in Psychology (PA TRAC)), a field on the transcript that indicates the student is enrolled in or has earned an P2P associate degree, or documentation accompanying the associate degree transcript when it's sent to the 4-yr college. Another suggestion is having 2-yr institutions enroll P2P students in a non-credit "dummy" course during the last semester and having that course appear on the student's transcript. When an advisor saw that course on the transcript, s/he would know that the student was in an P2P eligible program and should receive P2P benefits.

Two years ago TAOC formed an ad hoc subcommittee to address this issue. TAOC subsequently accepted the subcommittee's recommendation of having institutions identify their articulated degree programs in a database and creating a search feature on PA TRAC that 1) would allow students to find P2P degrees and 2) would allow institutions to verify P2P degrees earned by transfer students. In the database, 2-yr institutions identify an "effective graduation date" for the articulated degree; 4-yrs identify an "effective matriculation date" for their articulated degrees.

TAOC will reconvene this subcommittee and charge members with considering the issues/suggestions identified above and making a recommendation to TAOC at the August 15 TAOC meeting.

This group includes:

- Jill Murray, Lackawanna College
- Tom Gregory, Penn College of Technology
- Diane Bosak, PA Commission for Community Colleges
- Vicki Bastecki-Perez, Montgomery County CC
- Cindy Doherty, HACC
- Joe Santivasci, West Chester
- Emily Wagner, Kutztown
- Kathleen Howley, PASSHE
- Julie Kane, PDE

PDE will confirm whether these individuals are still able to participate on the subcommittee and contact Diane Bosak (PA Commission) or Kathleen Howley (PASSHE) if new sector representation is needed. Betsey Stevens (Slippery Rock) volunteered to fill a vacant PASSHE seat.

#### c. Institutional Verification

TAOC decided two years ago that each institution is responsible for identifying which of its degree programs meet the requirements of the approved statewide P2P agreements. These degrees are identified in the Statewide P2P database in the electronic transfer and articulation system and are accessible via the Statewide P2P Search on PA TRAC.

Created by legislation, the Dispute Resolution Subcommittee is the mechanism for resolving institutional disputes that emerge as a result of statewide P2P articulation. TAOC's dispute resolution process is outlined in <u>Section 5 of TAOC Policy Manual</u>.



#### d. Agreements

#### i. Addressing Framework Requirement in approved P2P agreements

Twelve approved P2P agreements include Framework requirements or recommendations. Bucks CCC proposed amendments to clarify these agreements. TAOC has not acted upon these proposals.

PDE suggested TAOC form an ad hoc subcommittee to review the proposed P2P amendments, to determine the reason for including the Framework in each agreement, and then, based on current TAOC policy, to recommend to TAOC how to proceed.

Catherine McElroy (Bucks) will lead the group. Other TAOC members who volunteered are Mike Hannan (Edinboro), Ginny Mihalik (Lehigh-Carbon CC), Allyson Lowe (Carlow), Mary Frances Archey (CCAC) and Peter Keller (Mansfield). The group is expected present its recommendations to TAOC at the August 15 meeting.

#### ii. Political Science

The Political Science P2P agreement that TAOC approved in December includes the Transfer Framework. However, the agreement is in limbo until TAOC decides how to handle agreements that either require or recommend Framework courses.

iii. Music

The Music PAC was at an impasse over how to address auditions/performance requirements of transfer students. They appear to have found a solution and should have an agreement ready for TAOC review/vote in mid-September.

#### iv. 4-8 Education

#### v. Secondary Education

The 4-8 PAC and Secondary Education PAC have faced unique challenges due to changing teacher certification requirements at the state-level. In addition, PAC members have retired, moved into new positions, etc., which means the PACs are not at full membership. PDE will work with the PAC TAOC reps to identify vacant seats and then reach out to Diane Bosak and Kathleen Howley to fill vacant seats in their respective sectors (CCs and PASSHE). In order for these agreements to be effective by Fall 2014, the agreements will need to be approved by TAOC before the end of September.

#### 8. 2-yr College Access to PAPA scores

The Statewide P2P Agreement for PK4 Certification requires associate degree students to pass the Pre-Service Academic Preparation Assessments (PAPAs), a series of basic skills tests in reading, writing and math before transferring to the 4-year institution. PAPAs are required of all teacher preparation candidates.

In order for Pearson (the PAPA testing service) to provide students' scores directly to 2-year institutions in the transfer system, PDE needs 2-yr institution TAOC reps to identify one Primary and one Secondary Contact to be responsible for receiving and maintaining the security of test results for their respective students. PDE will email a formal request to the TAOC reps sometime next week. Pearson will reach out to the contacts directly, once they receive the list from PDE.

For security purposes, only the Primary Contact will be given access to the PECT Online Institution Score Reporting System. This is a secure Web-based data transmission system that permits institutions online access to test results for the <u>Pennsylvania Educator Certification Tests</u> (<u>PECT</u>). A Pearson representative will follow up with institution contacts directly.



In addition to individual test scores, Pearson has designed PECT Reports to assist colleges in evaluating the effectiveness of their own educator preparation programs and in providing feedback and assistance to individual PECT examinees who authorized the institution to receive such information. The PECT Reports should not be used for any other purpose. Because of the proprietary, personal and confidential nature of the information contained in the PECT Reports, this information must be kept in secure storage, whether in locked file drawers or on computer systems that have been made secure from unauthorized access. Unless otherwise required by law, it should not be disclosed to anyone within the institution who does not need access to the information for use in pursuance of the purposes set forth above. Unless otherwise required by law, proprietary, personal and confidential information should not be disclosed to anyone outside the institution, without exception. The institution's disclosure policies should be consulted to determine who is authorized to receive other non-personal data or information.

## 9. Next Meeting – August 15 from 10AM-12:30PM



## May 23, 2013 Meeting Attendees:

TAOC Institution	TAOC Rep.	Location
Bloomsburg University of PA	Ira Blake	DUC
Bucks County Community College	Barbara Ford	MCCC
Bucks County Community College	Ronnie November	MCCC
Bucks County Community College	Catherine McElroy	Phone
California University of PA	Terrie Greene	Phone
California University of PA	Kaylee Gmutza	Phone
Carlow University	Allyson Lowe	IUP
Clarion University of PA	Ronald Nowaczyk	DUC
Community College of Allegheny County	Mary Frances Archey	Phone
Community College of Beaver County	Peggy Hennequant	CCBC
Community College of Beaver County	John Gall	CCBC
Community College of Philadelphia	Susan Tobia	MCCC
Community College of Philadelphia	Judy Gay	Phone
Edinboro University	Mike Hannan	DUC
Harrisburg Area Community College	James Baxter	DUC
Indiana University of PA	Bill Sands	IUP
Indiana University of Pennsylvania	Timothy Moerland	DUC
Kutztown University of PA	Lori Lentz	MCCC
Lackawanna College	Theresa Scopelliti	Phone
Lehigh Carbon Community College	Ginny Mihalik	DUC
Lehigh Carbon Community College	Tom Leamer	DUC
Lincoln University	Zizwe Poe	Phone
Lock Haven University	Donna Wilson	DUC
Lock Haven University of PA	Jill Mitchley	Phone
Luzerne County Community College	Libby Yeager	DUC
Luzerne County Community College	Dana Clark	DUC
Mansfield University of PA	Peter Keller	DUC
Maished University of PA	Robert Smith	DUC
Millersville University of PA	Vilas Prabhu	DUC
Millersville University of PA	Robert Smith	DUC
Montgomery County Community College	Michael Rivera	MCCC
Penn College of Technology	Tom Gregory	DUC
Penn College of Technology	Carol Lugg	DUC
Penn Highlands Community College	Michelle Stumpf	IUP
Pennsylvania Department of Education	Julie Kane	DUC
Pennsylvania Department of Education	Julie Rau	DUC
Reading Area Community College	Kevin McGovern	MCCC
	Pete Skoner	IUP
Saint Francis University		DUC
Shippensburg University of PA	Barbara Lyman Elizabeth Stevens	
Slippery Rock University	Philip Way	CCBC DUC
Slippery Rock University		
Temple University	Michele O'Connor	Phone
University of Pittsburgh	Ryan Mahramas	CCBC
West Chester University	Linda Lamwers	DUC
West Chester University of PA	Joe Santivasci	MCCC
Westmoreland County Community College	Bob Wright	CCBC



# Appendix A: Overview "Flyer" for Statewide Program-to-Program Agreements



**pennsylvania** TRANSFER AND ARTICULATION CENTER

PAITRAC - KEEPING YOU ON TRACK TO A COLLEGE DEGREE

# Pennsylvania Statewide Program-to-Program Agreement

Statewide Program-to-Program (P2P) Agreements allow students who graduate with specified associate degrees to transfer as juniors into bachelor's degrees in similar fields of study at participating four-year institutions.

P2P agreements serve as pathways into undergraduate majors and help minimize loss of credits when transferring from one institution to another.

#### HOW IT WORKS

Under Statewide P2P Agreements, the associate degree curriculum has been aligned with the first 60 credits of a matching bachelor's degree. For example, an Associate degree in Psychology aligns to a Bachelor's degree in Psychology.

Statewide P2P allows associate degree graduates to transfer into a participating four-year college with junior standing, receive at least 60 credits toward the matching bachelor's degree, and enter advanced coursework in the major.

Statewide P2P Agreements are developed at the state level by the <u>colleges and universities participating in the</u> <u>statewide transfer system</u>, not between individual colleges and universities. That means associate degree graduates have transfer options all across Pennsylvania!

## TRANSFER CRITERIA

Students are subject to the admissions and transfer credit policies of the participating institutions. These policies can be found on each institution's College Profile at PAcollegetransfer.com.

The transfer of coursework with a grade less than a C (2.0 on a 4.0 scale) will be consistent with the policies of native students at the four-year college.

Students may only transfer from a specific major to the matching major. One cannot, for example, transfer an Associate degree in Business to a Bachelor's degree in Chemistry.

Not all colleges and universities offer the same degree programs. Use the <u>Statewide P2P Agreement Search</u> to find P2P degrees and colleges that interest you.

Students should consult an academic advisor before enrolling in any coursework or degree program.

## FOR MORE INFORMATION

Visit <u>PAcollegetransfer.com</u> to contact a transfer advisor at the institution where you plan to earn your associate degree or bachelor's degree.

Click on "Learn More" below to search for Associate-to-Bachelor degree opportunities available through Pennsylvania Statewide P2P Articulation.

